Kemppinen, Antti; Kafanov, Sergey; Pashkin, Yury; Tsai, J.S.; Averin, D. V.; Pekola, J.P.

**Experimental investigation of hybrid single-electron turnstiles with high charging energy**

*Published in:*
Applied Physics Letters

**DOI:**
10.1063/1.3127229

Published: 01/01/2009

**Document Version**
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

*Please cite the original version:*
Experimental investigation of hybrid single-electron turnstiles with high charging energy

A. Kemppinen, S. Kafanov, Yu. A. Pashkin, J. S. Tsai, D. V. Averin, and J. P. Pekola

Citation: Appl. Phys. Lett. 94, 172108 (2009); doi: 10.1063/1.3127229
View online: http://dx.doi.org/10.1063/1.3127229
View Table of Contents: http://aip.scitation.org/toc/apl/94/17
Published by the American Institute of Physics
Experimental investigation of hybrid single-electron turnstiles with high charging energy

A. Kemppinen,1,a S. Kafanov,2 Yu. A. Pashkin,3 J. S. Tsai,3 D. V. Averin,4 and J. P. Pekola2

1Centre for Metrology and Accreditation (MIKES), P.O. Box 9, 02151 Espoo, Finland
2Low Temperature Laboratory, Helsinki University of Technology, P.O. Box 3500, 02015 TTK, Finland
3NEC Nano Electronics Research Laboratories, RIKEN Advanced Science Institute, 34 Miyukigaoka, Tsukuba, Ibaraki 305-8501, Japan
4Department of Physics and Astronomy, Stony Brook University, SUNY, Stony Brook, New York 11794-3800, USA

(Received 20 March 2009; accepted 10 April 2009; published online 1 May 2009)

We present an experimental study of hybrid turnstiles with high charging energies in comparison to the superconducting gap. The device is modeled with the sequential tunneling approximation. The backtunneling effect is shown to limit the amplitude of the gate drive and thereby the maximum pumped current of the turnstile. We compare results obtained with sine and square wave drive and show how a fast rise time can suppress errors due to leakage current. Quantized current plateaus up to 160 pA are demonstrated. © 2009 American Institute of Physics. [DOI: 10.1063/1.3127229]

Development of a quantum current standard based on the discreteness of the electron charge has been one of the major goals of metrology for more than twenty years.1 The desired standard would generate the current \( I/n \) by transferring \( n \) electrons (\( e \)) per cycle at frequency \( f \). The most precise device of this kind was based on seven tunnel junctions in series.2 It reached the relative accuracy of \( 10^{-8} \), but the maximum current was only on a picoampere level. However, closing the quantum metrological triangle,3 which is one of the prime needs for the quantum current standard, requires about 100 pA or more. The quest for standards with higher currents has involved several candidates, based, e.g., on superconducting tunnel junctions,4 single-electron transistors5 and semiconducting quantum dots.6 However, none of them has reached metrological accuracy. In this letter, we study the benefits of increased charging energy for the turnstile based on a hybrid single-electron transistor (SET), see Fig. 1(a), proposed and demonstrated in Ref. 7. It was first realized as a NISIN (N=normal-metal, I=insulator, and S=superconductor) structure, but the SINIS version reported in Ref. 8 promises higher accuracy.3

The operation of the turnstile is based on the superconducting gap \( \Delta \), which expands the stability domains of the charge states, see Figs. 1(b) and 1(c). A small bias voltage \( V_b \) can be applied since the current is ideally zero when \( |V_b| < 2\Delta/e \). The bias yields a preferred direction of tunneling, when the gate voltage \( V_g(t) \) is alternated between the charge states. The gate voltage is convenient to express in normalized units as \( V_g(t)/e = n_g(t) = n_{g0} + A_g w(t) \), where \( C_g, n_{g0}, \) and \( A_g \) are the gate capacitance, dc offset, and drive amplitude, correspondingly. The gate waveform, e.g., sine or square, is expressed with \( w(t) \). By extending the gate sweep over several charge states, current plateaus with \( n > 1 \) can be obtained. However, the first plateau is optimal for metrology.

The errors of the turnstile were analyzed theoretically in Ref. 9 in which, e.g., the tradeoff between the pumping speed and the error rate was considered. Experimentally, the most critical error source appears to be the subgap leakage, i.e., residual conductance in the superconducting gap.7,8,10 Often the leakage shows up as a constant slope at low bias. Then it can be described as the ratio \( \eta_g = R_g/R_n \) between the normal-state resistance and the leakage resistance at plateau \( n \). The index \( n=0 \) refers to the dc zero-bias leakage. Higher-order tunneling events due to Andreev reflection or Cooper-pair-electron cotunneling are known to be leakage processes that affect the operation of the turnstile.7 Possible other mechanisms include Cooper-pair breaking,11 nonequilibrium quasiparticles and nonidealities of the tunnel barrier. In Ref. 9 it was shown that the higher-order processes are suppressed by the Coulomb blockade. Specifically, Andreev re-

---

FIG. 1. (Color online) (a) Scanning electron micrograph of a typical turnstile, and a sketch of its measurement circuitry. The bright areas are AuPd (normal metal), and the darker parts are Al (superconductor). (b) Measured (gray) and simulated (black) dc IV curves of sample B. The dc gate voltage was swept during the measurement and hence the envelopes correspond to the simulated IV curves with \( n_g = 0, 0.5 \). (c) Measured dynamic conductance \( dI/dV_b \) of sample A as a function of \( V_g \) and \( n_g \). The white areas are stability regions of charge states, where the conductance is negligible. They are limited by the thresholds for tunneling in the direction preferred by positive bias (solid lines) and negative bias (dashed lines). The pumping gate signal, when applied, alternates along the thick black line.
TABLE I. The parameters of the samples A, B, and C.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Samples</th>
<th>$R_g$ (kΩ)</th>
<th>$E_c/k_B$ (K)</th>
<th>$\Delta$ (μeV)</th>
<th>$E_c/\Delta$</th>
<th>$n_0$ ($\times10^{-5}$)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>1540</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>315</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The charging energy $E_c = e^2/2C_x$ depends on the total capacitance of the island $C_x$. Note that here and in the amplitude threshold discussion below we assume the bias voltage $v_{V_b} = \Delta$, which minimizes the thermal errors. Together with the threshold for the wanted forward tunneling process, $A_{g,Ar} = \Delta/4E_c$, $A_{g,Ar}$ yields the requirement $E_c > \Delta$. In this case, the turnstile could be operated at error rates below $10^{-8}$, which is the prime motivation for studying turnstiles with high charging energy. This theoretical result was supported by the experiment of Ref. 8, where the leakage $n_0$ was below $10^{-5}$. Yet, typically, the leakage of SINIS structures has been of $n_0 < 10^{-4}$.

The first hybrid turnstiles were fabricated with standard two-layer electron beam lithography process, and the charging energy was of the order of $E_c/k_B = \Delta/k_B = 2.5$ K. 7,8 To increase $E_c$, we used the trilayer germanium process. 12 The samples were metalized in an electron-gun evaporator.

In this letter, we present data from three samples, A, B, and C, all with relatively high charging energy, but with substantial differences in $R_N$. All measurements were performed at temperature of about 0.1 K. The sample parameters are summarized in Table I. All samples show leakage that is too strong to be explained by the higher-order processes, and that strongest in the gate-open state, unlike expected for Andreev reflection. 9 In addition, the leakage parameter $n_0$ does not seem to depend on $R_N$. Albeit counterproductive in general, the observable leakage helps us here to demonstrate how the leakage at the plateau $n_0$ can be suppressed from $n_0$ by using square-wave drive.

The parameters of the samples were estimated by fitting their dc IV curves to simulations based on the sequential tunneling model including the cooling effect of the SINIS structure. 13 The measured and the simulated IV curves and backtunneling, i.e., tunneling in the direction against the bias. When the gate signal is extended over the backtunneling thresholds, the dashed lines in Fig. 1(c), tunneling in the forward direction is still preferred, but backtunneling can be statistically significant. With sinusoidal drive and at low frequencies, however, tunneling occurs typically before the backtunneling threshold is exceeded. Note that backtunneling prevents precise pumping of charge in the case of the normal metal SET. 7

The backtunneling effect can be seen as backbending of the current plateaus in Fig. 2(a). The effect is most pronounced at low $V_g$ and high $A_g$. The experimental backtunneling slopes are reproduced precisely by our simulations based on the sequential tunneling model with the sample parameters estimated from independent dc measurements.

Such an excellent agreement between the experimental data and simulations was also observed for the other two samples.

In Figs. 3(a) and 3(b) we show the effect of backtunneling on the pumped current of sample B at the first plateau $n_{0,0} = 0.5$ and $v_{V_b} = \Delta$, with both sine and square wave drive. In all cases, there is a flat region between the thresholds for forward tunneling ($A_{g,Ar}$) and backtunneling ($A_{g,Ar} = 3\Delta/4E_c$), shown by the dashed vertical lines. Above $A_{g,Ar}$, backtunneling deteriorates the pumping accuracy. Since the rise time of the square wave was constant, about 3 ns, the backtunneling rate did not depend on frequency. At 120 MHz, sine and square waves are almost identical due to the finite rise time of the square wave.

High gate amplitude increases the rate of forward tunneling and thus decreases the effect of missed tunneling. How close to $A_{g,Ar}$ the amplitude of the rf generator, which is 500 MHz.

In Figs. 3(a) and 3(b) we show the effect of backtunneling on the pumped current of sample B at the first plateau $n_{0,0} = 0.5$ and $v_{V_b} = \Delta$, with both sine and square wave drive. In all cases, there is a flat region between the thresholds for forward tunneling ($A_{g,Ar}$) and backtunneling ($A_{g,Ar} = 3\Delta/4E_c$), shown by the dashed vertical lines. Above $A_{g,Ar}$, backtunneling deteriorates the pumping accuracy. Since the rise time of the square wave was constant, about 3 ns, the backtunneling rate did not depend on frequency. At 120 MHz, sine and square waves are almost identical due to the finite rise time of the square wave.

High gate amplitude increases the rate of forward tunneling and thus decreases the effect of missed tunneling. How close to $A_{g,Ar}$ the amplitude of the rf generator, which is 500 MHz.
temperature. In general, the maximum amplitude is inversely proportional to $E_c$. In the experiments below, we used the amplitude half way between the thresholds $A_{g,\text{mean}}=\Delta/2E_c$, which is, e.g., about 0.17 for sample B. The pumping regime is thus drastically different from that of the first turnstiles with $E_c=\Delta$ and $A_{g,\text{mean}}=0.5$.

At zero temperature, the rate of single-electron tunneling process with electrostatic energy change $E_p=\Gamma_p = \sqrt{E_p^2 - \Delta^2}/R_{N,ij}c^2$, where $R_{N,ij}$ is the resistance of the junction $i$. The tunneling rates depend on $\Delta$, and since $E_p$ is roughly proportional to $1/C_2$, they depend also on the $R_{N,ij}C_2^2$ time constant. However, if the gate amplitude is limited by the backtunneling effect, the forward tunneling rate at the extreme gate value can be expressed as $\Gamma_p=\gamma_d\Delta/R_{N,ij}c^2$. The tunneling rate is thus independent of the capacitance. The prefactor $\gamma_d$ depends on the exact form of the amplitude limit, e.g., $\gamma_d=\sqrt{5}/2$ for $A_{g,\text{mean}}$ and $\gamma_d=\sqrt{3}$ for $A_{g,\text{bias}}$. In Ref. 9, the estimate for the maximum amplitude of the turnstile was based on $A_{g,\text{bias}}$, which increases as a function of $E_c$. Above $E_c=2\Delta$, however, backtunneling sets a more restrictive limit. Hence the maximum current saturates to somewhat above 10 pA estimated for $E_c=3\Delta$ with the superconducting gap of aluminum and error rate of $10^{-8}$.

There are two obvious strategies to increase the maximum current. Parallelization of turnstiles is an attractive option because of the simplicity of the operation of a single device. Another possibility is to find an alternative superconductor and to fabricate a device with both high $\Delta$ and high $E_c$.

An additional benefit of high charging energy is that it suppresses the leakage when the gate is not open. In Figs. 3(c) and 3(d) we demonstrate, as suggested in Ref. 9, how a square wave signal can be used to pass the gate-open state quickly and hence to decrease the slope of the plateau as a function of bias voltage. In Fig. 3(c), the plateau of sample B is clearly improved by using the square wave.

The effect of the square wave is more pronounced in the case of a fast sample and a low frequency. Then the influence of leakage is high in relative terms, and the rise times of the sine and square waves of our generator are significantly different. This can be seen in Fig. 3(d) with sample C and frequency 16 MHz. The slopes with sine and square waves are $\eta_1=9.8\times10^{-5}$ and $\eta_1=3.8\times10^{-5}$, correspondingly. Also, both the sine and the square wave plateaus extend to higher bias voltage than the dc plateau.

The results of Fig. 3 are traceable to the national low-current standard of MIKES, which was used to calibrate the Keithley 6430 current meter. It was then used to calibrate the DL Instruments 1211 current amplifier. The turnstile could not be measured with the Keithley current meter directly because of its relatively high input noise. The gain of the DL Instruments 1211 amplifier was stable within a few parts in $10^{-4}$ for several months. For each measurement, we determined the input bias of the amplifier by comparing different polarities. The uncertainty of our measurements was about $10^{-3}$. In the case of sample B at 64 MHz, also the turnstile reached the accuracy of about $10^{-4}$.

To conclude, we have studied the operation of SINIS turnstiles with high charging energy. The backtunneling effect was shown to limit the drive amplitude and thus the maximum current of the turnstile at the highest charging energies. Under certain circumstances, a square wave drive decreases the influence of subgap leakage. We note, however, that a square wave tends to heat the island, whereas a sine signal can also cool it. Hence, the optimum signal may be of some intermediate form.

We thank I. Iisakka for technical support and S. Giblin, A. Manninen, M. Meschke, and M. Möttönen for useful comments. The work was partially supported by Technology Industries of Finland Centennial Foundation, the Academy of Finland, and Japan Science and Technology Agency through the CREST Project. The research conducted within the EURAMET joint research project REUNIAM (A.K.) and the EU project SCOPE (S.K. and J.P.) has received funding from the European Community’s Seventh Framework Programme under Grant Agreement Nos. 217257 and 218783.